

**Executive Board Meeting – Teleconference/Webinar
Washington, D.C., September 21, 2015**

Chair, Pamela M. Aaltonen, PhD, RN

IN ATTENDANCE

Pamela M. Aaltonen, PhD, RN
Gail Bellamy, PhD
Georges C. Benjamin, MD
Lynn A. Bethel, RDH, MPH
Lisa Carlson, MPH, MCHES
Chris Chanyasukit, PhD, MPH
Richard J. Cohen, PhD
Ayman El-Mohandes, MD, MBBCh, MPH
José Ramón Fernández-Peña, MD, MPA
Durrell J. Fox, BS, CHW
Joyce R. Gaufin, BS
Barbara E. Giloth, DrPH
Ella Greene-Moton
Jeffrey S. Hallam, PhD, CHES
Camara P. Jones, MD, PhD, MPH
Resa M. Jones, PhD, MPH
Shiriki K. Kumanyika, PhD, MPH
Barbara A. Levin, MD, MPH
Vanessa G. Miller, DrPH, PHCNS-BC
Patricia D. Parker, MSPH
Renata Slayton, MPH

STAFF

Regina Davis Moss, PhD
Susan Polan, PhD
Kemi Oluwafemi
James Carbo
Deborah Dillard
Frances Atkinson
Ellen Galant
Torrey Wasserman

UNABLE TO ATTEND

Malcolm Bryant, MBBS, MPH
Paul Meissner, MSPH
Sonja Hutchins, MD, DrPH, MPH

Monday, September 21, 2015

Call to Order/Roll Call – Pam Aaltonen, PhD, RN, Chair

The meeting was called to order and the roll read by Executive Board Chair Pam Aaltonen.

Approval of the Meeting Agenda and Consent Agenda – Pam Aaltonen, Chair

The chair called for a motion to approve the agenda for the September 2015 Executive Board Meeting.

Motion:	To approve the September 21, 2015 Executive Board meeting agenda.
Motion:	Approved by voice vote.

The chair presented items on the consent agenda. Items on the consent agenda included the minutes of the July 2015 Executive Board meeting, leadership appointments and the election of new Agency Members.

Items on the consent agenda:

- The July Executive Board meeting minutes.
- Leadership appointments:
 - To appoint **Katherine Mitchell, MSW, Adeya Powell and Patricia Risics, DrPH, RD**, to the Action Board.
 - To appoint **Linda Degutis, DrPH, MSN**, to the Bylaws Committee.
 - To appoint **Lainne F. Estefan, PhD, MPH**, to the Martha May Eliot Awards Committee.
 - To appoint **Linda Landesman, DrPH, Henrie M. Treadwell, PhD, Patrick Remington, MD, PhD, Barry Levy, MD, MPH, David Wegman, MD, MSc, Bernard J. Turnock, MD, MPH, and Cody Mullen, PhD (Student Representative)** to the Publications Board.
- New Agency Members – Oregon Public Health Institute, Portland, Oregon; National Environmental Education Fund, Washington, D.C.; Barron County Health Department, Barron, Wisconsin; ACCESS Community Health and Research Center, Dearborn, Michigan; Notah Begay III Foundation, Santa Ana Pueblo, New Mexico; Blue Cross Blue Shield of Michigan Foundation, Detroit, Michigan; City of Columbus, Columbus, Ohio; Kane County Health Department, Aurora, Illinois; Champaign-Urbana Public Health District, Champaign, Illinois; Marshall County Health Department, Benton, Kentucky; Antelope Valley Partners for Health, Lancaster, California; Respiratory Health Association, Chicago, Illinois; University of Colorado School of Public Health, Aurora, Colorado; DuPage County Health Department, Wheaton, Illinois.

Due to errors on the new agency member document, the Executive Board will need to reapprove the Chicago Public Schools and Lake County Health Department and Community Health Center at the October meeting.

Dr. Giloth asked that the July Executive Board meeting minutes be amended to reflect how the Executive Board voted for the Legislator of the Year. Chair Aaltonen called for a motion to accept the consent agenda excluding the July meeting minutes.

Motion:	To approve the consent agenda:
	The proposed leadership appointments and the approval of new agency members.
Motion:	Approved by voice vote.

Chair Aaltonen then called for a motion to accept the July Executive Board meeting minutes as amended.

Motion:	To approve the July executive board meeting minutes as amended.
Motion:	Approved by voice vote.

Report of the Treasurer – Richard Cohen, PhD

Dr. Cohen began his remarks by thanking the members of the Finance and Audit Committee and APHA staff for their work. He explained his presentation would touch on two topics: he would provide an update on the fiscal year 2015 budget (pre-audit) and discuss the fiscal year 2016 budget through July 2015.

Dr. Cohen explained that the fiscal year 2015 audit is almost complete and the numbers he will discuss are pre-audit, meaning that some of the numbers could change, but it is unlikely. He said APHA ended the year with a loss of \$141,100 from operations, which was under the planned budget operations loss by \$325,540. He stated that the fiscal year 2015 budget was an approved deficit budget. The planned deficit paid for technology and APHA headquarters building upgrades. He said APHA ended the overall fiscal year 2015 with revenue of \$37,540 income net of investments and appreciation.

He went on to say that the Membership Department ended the year under budget by \$423,050; the Conventions Department ended the year under budget by \$97,024; the Publications Department had mixed results, with subscriptions ending the year over budget by \$69,177 and book sales and advertising under budget by \$20,718 and \$91,164 respectively. He concluded his report on fiscal year 2015 by stating that grants and contracts were under budget by \$131,352.

He then turned his attention to the fiscal year 2016 budget, noting that the numbers reflected in his report were for the month of August. He said that the change in net assets including investments, appreciation and depreciation was \$1,403,926, which is over projection by \$182,340 and over fiscal year 2015 by \$237,166.

He said the Membership Department is over budget by \$65,000; the Conventions Department is over budget by \$214,036 and expenses are under budget by \$28,002; the Publications Department continues to have mixed results with subscriptions over budget by \$3,638 and book sales and advertising under budget by \$15,356 and \$23,192 respectively. He noted that grants and contracts are under budget by \$116,520. Dr. Cohen said that it's too early in the year to evaluate APHA's fiscal performance.

Dr. Cohen concluded his presentation by saying he is pleased that APHA finished fiscal year 2015 in the black overall and that he had positive information to share about fiscal year 2016 year to date. However, he reminded board members that APHA revenue streams remain stressed going forward and that APHA has core operating needs to meet recurring expectations.

Dr. Cohen then took questions from the Executive Board. Dr. R. Jones asked that APHA staff prepare a business case for the proposed dues increase in advance of the Annual Meeting. Dr. Kumanyika asked whether there had been any APHA staff layoffs to date. Dr. Benjamin replied that there had not been any to date. At the conclusion of the discussion, Dr. Aaltonen thanked Dr. Cohen for his remarks and introduced the next agenda item.

Governing Council Report – Barbara Giloth, DrPH, Speaker

Dr. Giloth began her presentation by discussing the Governing Council meeting agenda for Chicago. She asked board members to review and contact her if they would like to add an additional agenda item or had any questions. She shared that due to voting issues on the mid-year call, the Council will need to re-vote on the November 2014 meeting minutes and the Section and SPIG policies.

Dr. Giloth discussed the pending bylaws changes including: the proposal to increase the number of Student Assembly representatives on the Council; the proposed change to the description of the Committee on Women's Rights; and the possible bylaws changes to the *American Journal of Public Health*.

She discussed the Governing Council roundtables scheduled for Sunday, Nov. 1, noting that the topic for 2015 is health equity. Dr. Giloth asked that Executive Board members participate as conveners and note-takers at the meeting.

Dr. Giloth asked if there will be a presentation to the Council on the joint membership project. Dr. Polan said that there will be a presentation to the Executive Board in October to discuss the future of the project.

Dr. Giloth then discussed the presentation to the Governing Council on using APHA policy as the basis for advocacy. She said the goal of the presentation is to engage Councilors on how they can help move advocacy forward. She said she is working with Dr. Benjamin, Dr. Miller, Dr. Amy Ferketich and Dr. Polan on the presentation.

Dr. Giloth concluded her presentation by discussing the proposed dues increase. She said she will work with Dr. Cohen and APHA staff to create a comprehensive slide presentation and work with the Council's parliamentarian to ensure that the process is clear and correct.

Dr. Giloth then called for questions from the board. Hearing no questions, Dr. Aaltonen thanked Dr. Giloth for her presentation and moved on to the next agenda item.

Caucus and Forum Policy Report – Pam Aaltonen, PhD, RN, Chair, Barb Levin, MD, MPH, and Ella Greene-Moton

Dr. Levin explained that she and Ms. Greene-Moton have been working with the Caucuses on the proposed policy since April. She said that once the policy is approved, she will step back and Ms. Greene-Moton will assist the Caucuses in developing the Caucus Collaborative and leadership within the group. Dr. Levin said that all of the current Caucuses have submitted their MOU.

She explained that one of the biggest sticking point to completing the policy was the provision to raise the minimum number of APHA members in a Caucus from 15 to 25. Dr. Levin discussed an emerging issue where the Collaborative wishes to develop a relationship with the Executive Board through a bylaws change. She said that one Caucus does not list their leadership so a document is being developed to identify responsible individuals to be the point of contact for the group. Dr. Levin then turned the presentation over to Ms. Greene-Moton.

Ms. Greene-Moton agreed with Dr. Levin's comments and added that she feels that the Collaborative is in a good place and the Caucus policy is strong. She said she looks forward to helping develop the

relationship between the Collaborative and the Executive Board and/or Governing Council, as it would be outlined in the bylaws.

At the conclusion of the presentation both Ms. Greene-Moton and Dr. Levin thanked the Membership and Component Affairs team for their support.

Dr. Aaltonen asked that either Dr. Levin or Ms. Greene-Moton make a motion to accept the policy on Recognition [and Discontinuation] of Caucuses. The motion was moved and seconded, and Dr. Aaltonen called for discussion.

Dr. Fernández-Peña asked if there had been any discussion to create a new ex-officio position on the Executive Board for the chair of the Caucus Collaborative. Ms. Greene-Moton said the issue was not discussed directly, but some of the discussion leans toward that, and she wouldn't be surprised if that was a future recommendation of the Collaborative. Dr. Aaltonen asked that the issue be referred to the Governance Committee for further discussion.

Dr. C. Jones asked about the timeliness of looking at the bylaws and proposing bylaws changes that would support adding the Chair of the Caucus Collaborative as an ex-officio member of the Executive Board. Dr. Aaltonen said that with the Annual Meeting a month away it would be difficult for the Governance Committee to evaluate and make a recommendation in time to be included in the upcoming Governing Council meeting.

Hearing no further comments or questions, Dr. Aaltonen called for a vote on the motion on the APHA Executive Board Policy on Recognition [and Discontinuation] of Caucuses.

<p>Motion: To Approve the APHA Executive Board Policy on Recognition [and Discontinuation] of Caucuses</p> <p>Motion: Approved by voice vote.</p>

Dr. Aaltonen then called for a motion to approve the APHA Executive Board Policy on Forums. The motion was moved and seconded, and Dr. Aaltonen called for discussion. Hearing no discussion, Dr. Aaltonen called for a vote.

<p>Motion: To approve the APHA Executive Board Policy on Forums.</p> <p>Motion: Approved by voice vote.</p>

Dr. Aaltonen thanked Ms. Greene-Moton and Dr. Levin for their work on the project and said she will add the policies to her presentation to the Governing Council. She then moved to the next agenda item.

American Journal of Public Health Project Interim Report – Joyce Gaufin, BS

Ms. Gaufin thanked Dr. Fernández-Peña for his support and guidance over the past several months. She said they have identified 17 people to interview to discuss the relationship between the Executive Board, the editor in chief of the Journal, the executive director, the *AJPH* Editorial Board and journal editors.

Ms. Gaufin said that what she's finding in her preliminary research is that there could be a bylaws issue related to how the Editorial Board provides feedback on the performance of the editor in chief and editors of the Journal. Another potential issue could be that members of the above mentioned groups simply don't understand their role and responsibility.

Ms. Gaufin said that three members of the board agreed to conduct interviews and that she hoped that a couple more people will volunteer. She said interviews should be complete by the first week in October, and she should have a preliminary report for the Executive Board by the October meeting.

Dr. Fernández-Peña thanked board members who assisted in developing and refining the interview questions and echoed Ms. Gaufin's call for volunteers.

Ms. Gaufin then took questions from Ms. Parker, and Dr. C. Jones. Dr. C. Jones asked Ms. Gaufin to clarify the purpose of the project. Hearing no further questions, Dr. Aaltonen thanked Ms. Gaufin and Dr. Fernández-Peña for their work and introduced the next agenda item.

Report of the Strategic Planning Committee – Gail Bellamy, PhD, Susan Polan, PhD

Dr. Bellamy briefly discussed the strategic planning document and said that board members will start seeing more information when they look at areas APHA is targeting, the kinds of tactics we're going to use and specific metrics that staff has been looking at that they can access quickly. She then turned the presentation over to Dr. Polan.

Dr. Polan explained that board members now have a more precise list of metrics and measures that staff will provide to them as a way to define the progress we are making on the strategic plan. She pointed out baseline data related to the Annual Meeting and the membership dashboard, which is a very easy graphic to read and comprehend. She concluded her comments by thanking the committee for their work and stating that she will provide more details at the October meeting.

Dr. Bellamy asked Ms. Greene-Moton to share her thoughts on the Membership Subcommittee of the Strategic Planning Committee. Ms. Greene-Moton discussed the newly created membership brochure and said that the Committee has met just a couple of times so she hopes to have more to report in October. She then asked APHA's Director of Membership Services, Ellen Galant, to share some of the things her department is doing. Ms. Galant discussed the membership brochure, the Drexel University School of Nursing project and her work with the Components. She concluded her remarks by saying she looks forward to giving a more comprehensive presentation to the board on October.

Hearing no further questions, Dr. Aaltonen thanked Dr. Bellamy, Ms. Greene-Moton, Dr. Polan and Ms. Galant and introduced the next agenda item.

2015 Annual Meeting: Opening General Session – Pam Aaltonen, PhD, RN, Chair, and Georges Benjamin, MD, Executive Director

Dr. Aaltonen began by discussing the sensitive nature of the issue before the board, She said that she would like Dr. Benjamin to provide background and then open the meeting for comments. But before turning the meeting over to Dr. Benjamin, she shared three areas for discussion (noting that all three may not be addressed at the meeting). She said that the board must make a decision on the Opening General Session Speaker; they should be prepared to manage the reaction of the membership; and the board needs to put a process in place for vetting future speakers. She asked the Governance Committee to discuss the vetting process for future General Session speakers. At the conclusion of her remarks, she asked Dr. Benjamin to share his comments.

Dr. Benjamin began his presentation by taking full responsibility for both identifying and inviting Ed Begley, Jr. to speak at the Opening General Session. He also took responsibility for missing Mr. Begley's advocacy against community fluoridation, and personally apologized to the board for their having to address this issue.

Dr. Benjamin then addressed some of the myths that have been circulating regarding general session speakers. He said that at the end of the Annual Meeting he receives many recommendations for speakers. He said he received names through the Annual Meeting survey, the program planning meeting and by people reaching out to him in person, by phone or via email. He said he collects the names and when the time comes, thinks about how APHA puts together the opening, Monday and closing sessions. He said he always tries to select speakers who are theme related to a timely matter important to APHA members. For example, the 2015 Closing General Session features the health commissioners of St. Louis County, Baltimore and Chicago to discuss building healthy and just communities.

He discussed his opinion of general session speakers, noting that he attempts to make those speakers more inspirational and engaging. He said he reaches out to speakers who will bring a different perspective. He discussed his rationale for changing the format of the opening general session to more of a TED Talk style, saying that he didn't want to put any speaker in a situation whereby they may be embarrassed because they are sitting on stage with someone who doesn't agree with them. This change was made 12 years ago. Dr. Benjamin assured the board that Mr. Begley would not be on a panel sitting on the stage at the Opening General Session.

Dr. Benjamin then explained how he came across Mr. Begley as a potential speaker. He said that he attended a meeting with APHA partner, EcoAmerica, and thought climate change would be a great subject to address at the Opening General Session in Chicago, he took a look at the EcoAmerica board of directors and noticed Mr. Begley's name. He explained that he did some preliminary research on Mr. Begley and found that he's an environmentalist and has done some really nice work in the area of climate change. Upon further review, Dr. Benjamin found that Mr. Begley supports the single payer insurance model.

Dr. Benjamin then reached out to the leadership of EcoAmerica to see if Mr. Begley was interested in speaking at our meeting. Initially, Mr. Begley was unavailable due to a scheduling conflict, but his calendar opened up and he agreed to address the meeting. Dr. Benjamin noted that APHA is paying for his flight from California and his hotel room for one evening. Dr. Benjamin stressed that APHA is not paying him a speaker's fee, APHA isn't providing him with a booth and is not selling, handing out or endorsing any of his products. In addition, he isn't there strictly as Ed Begley, he is there as a member of the EcoAmerica board of directors representing climate change.

While trying to identify an introductory video for Mr. Begley, Dr. Benjamin found his video on water fluoridation. Shortly after that, Dr. Benjamin spoke to Ms. Bethel, who shared her concerns and the concerns of the Oral Health Section with selecting Mr. Begley as a speaker. Dr. Benjamin then discussed the letters he received from all over the world condemning the selection of Mr. Begley.

Dr. Benjamin explained his feeling on APHA being the organization that allows anybody to say pretty much anything they want as long as it is consistent with their views. He reminded board members that APHA has had several controversial speakers over the years. Dr. Benjamin then shared his thoughts on the letter he wrote supporting his selection of Mr. Begley as a speaker. He said that since the letters of opposition were mostly addressed to him that he thought it was necessary to respond.

Dr. Benjamin then reiterated APHA's support for community water fluoridation. He said that APHA has policies on the issue and has sent many letters supporting community water fluoridation to cities and towns all across the United States. He said that people have expressed their concerns that by having Mr. Begley speak at the meeting it will somehow reflect poorly on the association and that our friends will walk away from us.

Dr. Benjamin reminded board members that sometimes APHA disagrees with other associations, including the American Dental Association on our support of dental therapists. He said that APHA has had disagreements with the American Medical Association over Medicare but worked with them on the Affordable Care Act and other initiatives. He pointed out that there are no permanent enemies, especially in Washington, D.C.

He said that Mr. Begley may not be with APHA on community water fluoridation; he does believe in and uses fluoride in his toothpaste. Dr. Benjamin believes APHA can engage him and possibly change his mind on the subject. He noted that Mr. Begley changed his mind on 9/11 and other issues over the years. Dr. Benjamin isn't confident that APHA can change his mind in advance of his speaking at the Annual Meeting but believes that there is an opportunity to work with him in the coming months. Mr. Begley has also said he is not against vaccines and that both he and his children are vaccinated. His vaccine position was a second concerned mentioned in some of the letters.

Dr. Benjamin argued that having Mr. Begley speak at the Opening General Session shows that APHA is inclusive, not ideological, and that APHA believes in science for the things in which people believe in science. And when APHA disagrees strongly with people, we're willing to try to help them change their mind.

At the conclusion of his remarks, Dr. Benjamin turned the meeting over to Dr. Aaltonen, who reiterated her comments on the sensitivity surrounding this issue and requested that board members be respectful of one another in their comments. She then explained the process by which Executive Board members will be chosen to speak. She said that everyone who wants to comment will have the opportunity to do so. She said that if the board chooses, they could hold a vote to either support or rescind the invitation to Mr. Begley. With that, she opened the floor for comments.

The ensuing discussion produced several thoughtful comments and suggestions. Those advocating keeping Mr. Begley as a speaker shared the following comments:

- Rescinding Mr. Begley's invitation would be inappropriate at this time but we need to reconsider the speaker vetting process for future meetings.
- While I don't agree with Mr. Begley's position, I have a real discomfort in not allowing people a chance to speak and not accepting people in our midst that don't agree with us.
- Somehow APHA needs to be able to open up the discussion in such a way that everyone is aware that positive and negative public health positions can be mixed into one person.

- I absolutely disagree with Ed Begley about fluoridation, but he's not the first person who's going to speak at an APHA opening or closing session that I disagree with. The reality is I really believe that we need to disagree but not be disagreeable.

Those advocating rescinding the invitation to Mr. Begley as a speaker shared the following comments:

- I believe we should rescind the invitation to Mr. Begley; there are other qualified speakers in the area of climate change.
- Mr. Begley's opinion and the misinformation that he's spreading about water fluoridation is dead set against what APHA believes in.
- Ed Begley is not a public health expert.
- Mr. Begley has blatant disregard for evidence-based science and chooses to misinform the public to their detriment.

After a long period of discussion, Dr. Aaltonen summarized a list of suggestions if Mr. Begley was retained as a speaker. Board members suggested: highlighting the 70th anniversary water fluoridation session in the Annual Meeting program and at the Opening General Session; giving someone from the Oral Health Section the opportunity to address water fluoridation at the Opening General Session; having a cadre of oral health experts meet with Mr. Begley in California prior to his speech to APHA and work with Mr. Begley on his speech prior to the Annual Meeting.

Dr. C. Jones put forth a motion that Mr. Begley be contacted and told that we do not want him to speak at the Opening General Session, but we would be delighted to have him join a scientific session on water fluoridation at his convenience. Dr. Aaltonen called for a second and hearing none declared that the motion had failed.

Dr. Aaltonen then called for another motion. Dr. Giloth made a motion that Mr. Begley's invitation remain, and that a sub group of Executive Board members work with Dr. Benjamin to come up with a plan to impact the opening session and also some of the other issues raised by the Oral Health Section and their supporters. Dr. Aaltonen asked for a second, the motion was seconded by Dr. Kumanyika and hearing no further discussion, Dr. Aaltonen called for a vote.

The vote was recorded by Executive Board members using the touchtone keypad on their telephone. Executive Board members had the option to vote for the motion against the motion or abstain from voting on the motion. Please note that the executive director and the chairs of the Action, Education and Science Boards are ex-officio members of the Executive Board without a vote.

Motion:	That Mr. Begley's invitation remain, and that a sub group of Executive Board members work with Dr. Benjamin to come up with a plan to impact the Opening General Session and also some of the other issues raised by the Oral Health Section and their supporters.
Motion:	Yes – 15 No – 2 Abstentions - 0

At the conclusion of the vote, Dr. Aaltonen thanked the board for thoughtful and productive discussion. She said that she will work with Dr. Benjamin on naming a sub group of the board to work with him on

the Opening General Session and other issues raised by the Oral Health Section. She then introduced the next agenda item.

Executive Director's Report – Georges Benjamin, MD

Dr. Benjamin briefly discussed the Annual Meeting, noting that as of Sept. 21, just over 10,000 people were registered. He said that is the highest number of registrants APHA has had at this point in the last few years. He said that booth sales are a challenge — 489 booths have been sold as of Sept. 21. He said that the Monday General Session featuring members of the Prevention Council is coming along nicely.

Dr. Benjamin announced said that U.S. Senator Ed Markey of Massachusetts was named as the Legislator of the Year. He went on to say that the Board will discuss conflict of interest in policymaking and Association leadership and the proposed dues increase (10 percent increase, schools and programs proposal and an increase and slight restructuring in agency dues) at the October Executive Board meeting.

Dr. Aaltonen thanked Dr. Benjamin for his report and introduced the next agenda item.

Executive Board Member Annual Meeting Responsibilities – Pam Aaltonen, PhD, RN, Chair

Dr. Aaltonen discussed Executive Board member responsibilities at the Annual Meeting. She explained the two categories of participation; the first category is comprised of events that members are strongly encouraged to attend, and the second category is comprised of events that members can choose to attend.

She said an event survey will be emailed to them immediately following the meeting and to please complete it by Friday, Oct. 2. She asked board members sign up for at least two voluntary events.

Dr. Aaltonen made brief concluding remarks related to the October Executive Board meeting agenda, and, there being no further business, adjourned the meeting.

The next Executive Board meeting will take place at the Sheraton Chicago Hotel and Towers Oct. 29 – 30, 2015 in Chicago, Illinois.